Interval Analysis and Optimization Applied to Parameter Estimation under Uncertainty

Mathematical Engineering
CB0441 - Research Practice 2
Final Presentation
June $10^{\text {th }}, 2015$

Jose D. Gallego-Posada
jgalle29@eafit.edu.co
María E. Puerta-Yepes
mpuerta@eafit.edu.co
Functional Analysis and Applications
Research Group
unvespan
EAFIT

1 Justification
2 The Interval Number System
3 Operations of Interval Arithmetic
4 Limits and Continuity
5 Order Relations for Intervals
6 Differentiability
7 Optimization Problem Formulation - KKT Conditions
8 Applications
9 References

## Justification

## UNIVERSIDAD <br> EAFIT

## Why should we use intervals?



Figure 1: SPD $[\mathrm{dB} / \mathrm{Hz}]$ vs Frequency $[\mathrm{Hz}]$

## Why should we use intervals?

- Which measurement is the most reliable one?


## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Why should we use intervals?

- Which measurement is the most reliable one?
- If you do not know the value, at least a bounding can be established


## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Why should we use intervals?

- Which measurement is the most reliable one?
- If you do not know the value, at least a bounding can be established
- How to estimate the error?


## Uuvasaman EAFIT

## Why should we use intervals?

- Which measurement is the most reliable one?
- If you do not know the value, at least a bounding can be established
- How to estimate the error?
- Uncertainty - Dispersion


## unversiliad EAFIT

## Why should we use intervals?

- Which measurement is the most reliable one?
- If you do not know the value, at least a bounding can be established
- How to estimate the error?
- Uncertainty - Dispersion
- Modelling complex dynamics with low information available.


## unversiliad EAFIT

## Why should we use intervals?

- Which measurement is the most reliable one?
- If you do not know the value, at least a bounding can be established
- How to estimate the error?
- Uncertainty - Dispersion
- Modelling complex dynamics with low information available.
- Robustness


## UNIVERSIPAD

## Definition - Notation

Consider the closed interval denoted by $[a, b]$ which represents the set of real numbers given by

$$
[a, b]=\{x \in(R): a \leq x \leq b\}
$$

Define $I(\mathbb{R}):=\{[a, b]: a \leq b, a, b \in \mathbb{R}\}$ be the set of all closed intervals of $\mathbb{R}$. We say a interval $[a, b]$ is degenerate if $a=b$.

We adopt the infimum-supremum notation for intervals:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& X=\left[X^{L}, X^{U}\right] \text { with } X^{L}, X^{U} \in \mathbb{R} \\
& X=Y \text { if } X^{L}=Y^{L} \wedge X^{U}=Y^{U}
\end{aligned}
$$

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Relevance of Intersection

Intersection plays a key role in interval analysis. If we have two intervals containing a result of interest - regardless of how they were obtained - then the intersection, which may be narrower, also contains the result.


Figure 2: Intersection of measurements.

## The Interval Number System

## UNIVERSIDAD <br> EAFIT

## Width, Absolute Value, Midpoint (I)

Length

$$
I(X):=X^{U}-X^{L}
$$

## Absolute Value

$$
|X|:=\max \left\{\left|X^{L}\right|,\left|X^{U}\right|\right\}
$$

Midpoint

$$
m(X):=\frac{1}{2}\left(X^{L}+X^{U}\right)
$$

## The Interval Number System

## UNIVERSIDAD <br> EAFIT

## Width, Absolute Value, Midpoint (II)



Figure 3 : Width, absolute value, and midpoint of an interval.

## Definition of Arithmetic Operations

Let $\odot \in\{+,-, \cdot, /\}$ be a binary operation in the real numbers, e.g., addition, subtraction, multiplication and division.

$$
X \odot Y:=\{x \odot y: x \in X, y \in Y\}
$$

In order to simplify notation, the interval $[x, x]$ will be referred as the real number $x$ itself, whenever the context is clear.

## Endpoint Formulas for the Arithmetic Operations

Let $X, Y \in I(\mathbb{R})$. It can be shown that:

1. $X+Y=\left[X^{L}+Y^{L}, X^{U}+Y^{U}\right]$ Example
2. $-Y=\left[-Y^{U},-Y^{L}\right]$ Example
3. $X-Y=X+(-Y)=\left[X^{L}-Y^{U}, X^{U}-Y^{L}\right]$

Example
4. $k X=\left[k X^{L}, k X^{U}\right]$ Example
5. $X Y=[\min S, \max S]$, where

$$
\begin{equation*}
S=\left\{X^{L} Y^{L}, X^{L} Y^{U}, X^{U} Y^{L}, X^{U} Y^{U}\right\} \tag{Example}
\end{equation*}
$$

6. $1 / Y=\left[1 / Y^{U}, 1 / Y^{L}\right]$
7. $X / Y=X \cdot(1 / Y)$ Example

## Embedding $I(\mathbb{R})$ in a Vector Space

## Structure of $I(\mathbb{R})$

Because of this lack of inverse elements under addition, $I(\mathbb{R})$ can not constitute a vector space by itself. However, the work from Radstroem develops the theory of an extension set via equivalence relations in which a commutative semigroup in which the law of cancellation holds, as is indeed true in $I(\mathbb{R})$, can be embedded in a vector space $N$ where the product $\lambda A$ for $\lambda \geq 0$ coincides with the one given on $I(\mathbb{R})$.

## Hukuhara Difference

## Difference

Let $X=\left[X^{L}, X^{U}\right]$ and $Y=\left[Y^{L}, Y^{U}\right]$ be two closed intervals in $\mathbb{R}$. If $X^{L}-Y^{L} \leq X^{U}-Y^{U}$, then the Hukuhara difference $Z=X \ominus Y$ exists and $Z=\left[Z^{L}, Z^{U}\right]=\left[X^{L}-Y^{L}, X^{U}-Y^{U}\right]$.

## Note

The usual subtraction and the Hukuhara difference between two intervals need not be the same:

$$
\left[X^{L}-Y^{U}, X^{U}-Y^{L}\right]=X-Y \neq X \ominus Y=\left[X^{L}-Y^{L}, X^{U}-Y^{U}\right]
$$

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Hausdorff Metric

Let $X, Y \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{n}$. Then the Hausdorff metric between $X$ and $Y$ is defined by

$$
d_{H}(X, Y)=\max \left\{\sup _{x \in X} \inf _{y \in Y}\|x-y\|, \sup _{y \in Y} \inf _{x \in X}\|x-y\|\right\}
$$

where $\|\cdot\|$ is a norm in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$.
If $X=\left[X^{L}, X^{U}\right]$ and $Y=\left[Y^{L}, Y^{U}\right]$ are two closed intervals in $\mathbb{R}$, it is not hard to see that

$$
d_{H}(X, Y)=\max \left\{\left|X^{L}-Y^{L}\right|,\left|X^{U}-Y^{U}\right|\right\}
$$

## Convergence

## Convergence in $/(\mathbb{R})$

Let $\left\{X_{n}\right\}$ and $X \in I(\mathbb{R})$. We say that the sequence of intervals $\left\{X_{n}\right\}$ converges to $X$, denoted by $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} X_{n}=X$, if, for every $\epsilon>0$, there exists $N \in \mathbb{N}$, such that, for $n \geq N$, we have $d_{H}\left(X_{n}, X\right)<\epsilon$.

Lemma

$$
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} X_{n}=X \text { if and only if } X_{n}^{L} \rightarrow X^{L} \wedge X_{n}^{U} \rightarrow X^{U}
$$

## Functions in $I(\mathbb{R})(I)$

## Interval-valued Function

The function $f: \mathbb{R}^{n} \rightarrow I(\mathbb{R})$ defined on an Euclidean space $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ is called an interval-valued function. This function can also be written as $f(x)=\left[f^{L}(x), f^{U}(x)\right]$, where $f^{L}$ and $f^{U}$ are real-valued functions defined on $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ and satisfy $f^{L}(x) \leq f^{U}(x)$ for every $x \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$.

## Limit of a Function

For $\mathbb{C} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$ we write $\lim _{\mathbb{x} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}} f(\mathbb{x})=X$ if, for every $\epsilon>0$, there exists $\delta>0$ such that, for $\|\mathfrak{x}-\mathbb{C}\|<\delta$, we have $d_{H}(f(x), X)<\epsilon$.

## Functions in $I(\mathbb{R})(I I)$

## Lemma

Let $f$ be an interval-valued function defined on $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ and $X=\left[X^{L}, X^{U}\right]$ be an interval in $\mathbb{R}$. Then $\lim _{x \rightarrow \mathbb{C}} f(x)=X$ if and only if $\lim _{x \rightarrow \mathbb{C}} f^{L}(x)=X^{L}$ and $\lim _{x \rightarrow \mathbb{C}} f^{U}(x)=X^{U}$.

## Continuity

Let $f$ be an interval-valued function defined on $\mathbb{R}^{n}$. We say that $f$ is continuous at $\mathbb{C} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$ if

$$
\lim _{\mathfrak{x} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}} f(\mathfrak{x})=f(\mathbb{C})
$$

## universidad <br> EAFIT

## Example



Figure 4: Graphic representation $f(x)=\left[x^{2}+x+1, x^{2}+3\right]$.

## Order Relations

Let $X=\left[X^{L}, X^{U}\right]$ and $Y=\left[Y^{L}, Y^{U}\right] \in I(\mathbb{R})$. It is possible to express $X$ as a function of its center and width, as $X=\langle m(X), w(X)\rangle$.

## Order Relations

$$
X \preceq_{L U} Y \text { if and only if } X^{L} \leq Y^{L} \text { and } X^{U} \leq Y^{U}
$$

$$
X \preceq c w Y \text { if and only if } m(X) \leq m(Y) \text { and } w(X) \leq w(Y)
$$

$$
X \preceq U C Y \text { if and only if } X^{U} \leq Y^{U} \text { and } m(X) \leq m(Y)
$$

## Order Relations for Intervals

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Order Relations



Figure $5: ~ a) ~ \preceq \iota U ~ b) ~ \preceq c w ~ c) ~ \preceq u c ~$

## Weak Differentiability

## Weak Differentiability

Let $X$ be an open set in $\mathbb{R}$. An interval-valued function $f: X \rightarrow I(\mathbb{R})$ with $f(x)=\left[f^{L}(x), f^{U}(x)\right]$ is called weakly differentiable at $x_{0}$ if the real valued functions $f^{L}$ and $f^{U}$ are differentiable at $x_{0}$ (in the usual sense).

## H-Differentiability (I)

## Derivative

Let $X$ be an open set in $\mathbb{R}$. We say $f: X \rightarrow I(\mathbb{R})$ is $H$-differentiable (strongly differentiable) at $x_{0}$ if there exists $A\left(x_{0}\right) \in R(\mathbb{R})$ such that

$$
\lim _{h \rightarrow 0^{+}} \frac{f\left(x_{0}+h\right) \ominus f\left(x_{0}\right)}{h} \text { and } \lim _{h \rightarrow 0^{+}} \frac{f\left(x_{0}\right) \ominus f\left(x_{0}-h\right)}{h}
$$

both exist and are equal at $A\left(x_{0}\right)$. Then $A\left(x_{0}\right)$ is the $H$-derivative of $f$ at $x_{0}$.

## H-Differentiability (II)

## Theorem

Let $X$ be an open set in $\mathbb{R}$ and $f: X \rightarrow I(\mathbb{R})$ an interval-valued function defined on $X$. Suppose that $f$ is weakly differentiable at $x_{0}$ with derivatives $\left(f^{L}\right)^{\prime}\left(x_{0}\right)=\hat{A^{L}}\left(x_{0}\right)$ and $\left(f^{U}\right)^{\prime}\left(x_{0}\right)=\hat{A^{U}}\left(x_{0}\right)$.

1. If $f^{L}\left(x_{0}+h\right)-f^{L}\left(x_{0}\right) \leq f^{U}\left(x_{0}+h\right)-f^{U}\left(x_{0}\right)$ and $f^{L}\left(x_{0}\right)-f^{L}\left(x_{0}-h\right) \leq f^{U}\left(x_{0}\right)-f^{U}\left(x_{0}-h\right)$ for every $h>0$, then $f$ is H -differentiable at $x_{0}$ with H -derivative $A\left(x_{0}\right)=\left[\hat{A^{L}}\left(x_{0}\right), \hat{A^{U}}\left(x_{0}\right)\right]$.
2. If $\hat{A^{U}}\left(x_{0}\right)>\hat{A^{L}}\left(x_{0}\right)$, then $f$ is H -nondifferentiable at $x_{0}$.

## Optimization Problem Formulation - KKT Conditions

## UNIVERSIDAD <br> EAFIT

## Optimization Problems

## Problem (RVOP)

$$
\begin{gathered}
\min \quad f(x)=f\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right) \\
\text { subject to } g_{i}(x) \leq 0
\end{gathered}
$$

## Problem (IVOP)

$$
\begin{gathered}
\min f(x)=\left[f^{L}\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right), f^{U}\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)\right]=\left[f^{L}(x), f^{U}(x)\right] \\
\text { subject to } g_{i}\left(x^{(x)} \leq 0\right.
\end{gathered}
$$

## Optimization Problem Formulation - KKT Conditions

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Solution Types

## Type-I

Let $x^{*}$ be a feasible solution, i.e., $x^{*} \in X$. We say that $x^{*}$ is a type-I solution of problem (IVOP) if there exists no $\overline{\mathcal{K}} \in X$ such that $f(\overline{\mathrm{~K}}) \prec_{L U} f\left(\mathfrak{x}^{*}\right)$.

## Type-II

Let $x^{*}$ be a feasible solution, i.e., $x^{*} \in X$. We say that $x^{*}$ is a type-II solution of problem (IVOP) if there exists no $\bar{x} \in X$ such that $f(\bar{x}) \prec_{L U} f\left(x^{*}\right)$ or $f(\bar{x}) \prec C W f\left(x^{*}\right)$.

## KKT Conditions

## Theorem (Wu [2])

Assume that the constraint functions $g_{i}: \mathbb{R}^{n} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ are convex on $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ for $i=1, \ldots, m$. Let $X=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{n}: g_{i}(\mathbb{x}) \leq 0, i=1, \ldots, m\right\}$ be a feasible set and a point $\mathfrak{z}^{*} \in X$. Suppose that the intervalvalued objective function $f: \mathbb{R}^{n} \rightarrow I(\mathbb{R})$ is LU-convex and weakly continuously differentiable at $\mathfrak{z}^{*} \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$. If there exist (Lagrange) multipliers $0<\lambda^{L}, \lambda^{U} \in R$ and $0 \leq \mu_{i} \in \mathbb{R}, i=1, \ldots, m$, such that

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 1. } \lambda^{L} \nabla f^{L}\left(\mathfrak{k}^{*}\right)+\lambda^{U} \nabla f^{U}\left(x^{*}\right)+\sum_{i=1}^{m} \mu_{i} \nabla g_{i}\left(x^{*}\right)=0 \\
& \text { 2. } \mu_{i} g_{i}\left(\mathfrak{k}^{*}\right)=0 \text { for all } i=1, \ldots, m \text {. }
\end{aligned}
$$

then $x^{*}$ is a type-I and type-II, i.e. optimal under the selected order relation, solution of problem (IVOP).

## Interval-Valued Polynomial

## Interval-Valued Polynomial

Let $c_{i}=\left[c_{i}^{L}, c_{i}^{U}\right] \in I(\mathbb{R})$ for $i \in \mathbb{N}$. We say $p(x)$ is an interval-valued polynomial if it can be expressed in the form

$$
p(x)=\sum_{i=0}^{n} c_{i} \cdot x^{i}=\sum_{i=0}^{n}\left[c_{i}^{L}, c_{i}^{U}\right] \cdot x^{i}
$$

## UNIVERSIPAD

## Matrix Representation

## Vandermonde Matrix

Let $c_{i}=\left[c_{i}^{L}, c_{i}^{U}\right] \in I(\mathbb{R})$ for $i \in\{1, \ldots, n\}$.

$$
\begin{gathered}
{\left[\begin{array}{c}
y_{1} \\
\vdots \\
y_{m}
\end{array}\right]=\left[\begin{array}{ccccc}
1 & x_{1} & x_{1}^{2} & \cdots & x_{1}^{n} \\
1 & x_{2} & x_{2}^{2} & \cdots & x_{2}^{n} \\
\vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\
1 & x_{m} & x_{m}^{2} & \cdots & x_{m}^{n}
\end{array}\right]\left[\begin{array}{c}
c_{0} \\
\vdots \\
c_{n}
\end{array}\right]+\left[\begin{array}{c}
\varepsilon_{0} \\
\vdots \\
\varepsilon_{n}
\end{array}\right]} \\
\mathscr{V}=\mathbb{C}+\mathbb{E}
\end{gathered}
$$

In this case, $\mathbb{V}$ is called a Vandermonde matrix.

## Example



Figure 6: Interval-valued polynomial graphic.

## What do we look for?

## In a nutshell

Find a parameter configuration that reduces at most as possible the discrepancies between the observed data and the information provided by the model proposed.
$\min \sum_{i=1}^{m}\left[m\left(y_{i}\right)-m\left(\widehat{y}_{i}\right)\right]^{2}$
$\ell_{2}$ Norm - Least Squares

$$
\min \sum_{i=1}^{m} d_{H}\left(y_{i}, \widehat{y}_{i}\right)
$$

$\ell_{1}$ Norm - Least Absolute Values

## $\ell_{2}$ Norm - Least Squares Estimation



Figure 7: Parameter estimation result using OLS.

## UNIVERSIDAD <br> EAFIT

## $\ell_{1}$ Norm - Heuristic



Figure 8: Parameter estimation result using Differential Evolution.

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## $\ell_{1}$ Norm - CVX



Figure 9 : Parameter estimation result using CVX.

## Chaotic Behaviour

## Weierstrass Function

In order to evaluate the feasibility of an estimations of the parameters of a model using real data, the used techniques were tested using data sampled from a Weierstrass function, which is an example of a pathological real-valued function on the real line, given by

$$
f(x)=\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} a^{n} \cos \left(b^{n} \pi x\right)
$$

## Applications

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Chaotic Behaviour



Figure 10: Weierstrass Function Model.

## Experimental Data

## Spectral Power Density Measurements

Using hydrophones, measurements of the spectral power density of the sound signals generated by vessels were performed in order to develop a characterization of such crafts. In total 36 measurements were performed, however 12 of those were discarded due to factors that generated changes in behaviour of the spectrum, for example, changes in the speed of the boat and its engines.

Experiment Design


Figure 11: Experiment designed for the sampling process.

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Experimental Data



Figure 12: Measurements - SPD [dB/Hz] vs Frequency $[\mathrm{Hz}]$.

## Mathematical Model

## Fourier Series

In order to describe this behaviour a Fourier series model was proposed. A Fourier series is a way to represent a wave-like function as the sum of simple sine waves, decomposing the signal into the sum of a (possibly infinite) set of simple oscillating functions, namely sines and cosines, as follows:

$$
f(x)=a_{0}+\sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{i} \cos (i w x)+b_{i} \sin (i w x)
$$

## universidad EAFIT

## Upper - Lower Bounding



Figure 13: Fitted lower bound.


Figure 14: Fitted upper bound.

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Upper - Lower Bounding



Figure 15: Fitted model bounds.

## Mathematical Model

## Fourier Series

Using these estimations an interval-valued function was proposed to enclose the volatility of the measurements using Fourier series to describe the lower and upper functions, i.e. $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow I(\mathbb{R})$, given by $f(x)=\left[f^{L}(x), f^{U}(x)\right]$, where the bounding functions can be expressed by:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& f^{L}(x)=a_{0}^{L}+\sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{i}^{L} \cos \left(i w^{L} x\right)+b_{i}^{L} \sin \left(i w^{L} x\right) \\
& f^{U}(x)=a_{0}^{U}+\sum_{i=1}^{n} a_{i}^{U} \cos \left(i w^{U} x\right)+b_{i}^{U} \sin \left(i w^{U} x\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## universidad EAFIT

## Estimated Model



Figure 16: Interval-valued plot of the estimated Fourier series model.

Modeled Behaviour


Figure 17: Real data vs Model output.

## References (I)

1 R. Moore, R. Kearfott and M. Cloud, Introduction to interval analysis. Philadelphia, PA: Society for Industrial and Applied Mathematics, 2009.

2 H. Wu, The Karush-Kuhn-Tucker optimality conditions in an optimization problem with interval-valued objective function, European Journal of Operational Research, vol. 176, no. 1, pp. 46-59, 2007.

3 A. Tarantola, Inverse problem theory and methods for model parameter estimation. Philadelphia, PA: Society for Industrial and Applied Mathematics, 2005.

## References (II)

4 Michael Grant and Stephen Boyd. Graph implementations for nonsmooth convex programs, Recent Advances in Learning and Control (a tribute to M. Vidyasagar), V. Blondel, S. Boyd, and H. Kimura, editors, pages 95-110, Lecture Notes in Control and Information Sciences, Springer, 2008. http://stanford.edu/~boyd/graph_dcp.html.

5 Michael Grant and Stephen Boyd. CVX: Matlab software for disciplined convex programming, version 2.0 beta. http://cvxr.com/cvx, September 2013.

## Examples

## unversioan EAFIT

## Addition - Example

## Addition

$$
X=[1,2] \quad Y=[-4,5]
$$

$$
X+Y=[1,2]+[-4,5]=[1+(-4), 2+5]=[-3,7]
$$

## Examples

## universidad EAFIT

## Negative - Example

Negative

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-5,2] \\
-X=[-2,-(-5)]=[-2,5]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Examples

## UNIVERSIDAD EAMTIT

## Substraction - Example

## Substraction

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-5,2] \quad Y=[-1,9] \\
X+(-Y)=[-5,2]+[-9,1]=[-14,3]
\end{gathered}
$$

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT.

## Scalar Multiplication - Example

## Scalar Multiplication (I)

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-5,2] \quad k=3 \\
3 X=[-5 \cdot 3,2 \cdot 3]=[-15,6]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Scalar Multiplication (II)

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-5,2] \quad k=-8 \\
-8 X=[2 \cdot-8,-5 \cdot-8]=[-16,40]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Examples

## universidad <br> EAFIT

## Product - Example

## Product

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-5,2] \quad Y=[-1,9] \\
S=\{(-5)(-1),(-5)(9),(2)(-1),(2)(9)\} \\
X Y=[\min S, \max S]=[-45,18]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Examples

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Multiplicative Inverse - Example

Multiplicative Inverse (I)

$$
X=[2,8] \rightarrow \frac{1}{X}=\left[\frac{1}{8}, \frac{1}{2}\right]
$$

## Multiplicative Inverse (II)

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-1,5] \\
\frac{1}{X}=\left\{\frac{1}{x}: x \in X\right\}=(-\infty, \infty)
\end{gathered}
$$

## Examples

## UNIVERSIDAD <br> EAFIT

## Division - Example

## Division

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-5,2] \quad Y=[3,7] \\
\frac{1}{Y}=\left[\frac{1}{7}, \frac{1}{3}\right] \\
S=\left\{(-5)\left(\frac{1}{7}\right),(-5)\left(\frac{1}{3}\right),(2)\left(\frac{1}{7}\right),(2)\left(\frac{1}{3}\right)\right\} \\
\frac{X}{Y}=[\min S, \max S]=\left[-\frac{5}{3}, \frac{2}{3}\right]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Examples

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Hukuhara Difference - Example

## Hukuhara Difference

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[-5,2] \quad Y=[-1,3] \\
X \ominus Y=[-5,2] \ominus[-1,3]=[-5-(-1), 2-3] \\
X \ominus Y=[-4,-1]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Additive Inverses - Example

## Additive Inverses

$$
X=[-5,2]
$$

## Usual Difference

$$
\begin{gathered}
X-X=[-5,2]-[-5,2]=[-5,2]+[-2,5] \\
X-X=[-7,7]=7[-1,1] \ni[0,0]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Hukuhara Difference

$$
X \ominus X=[-5,2] \ominus[-5,2]=[-5-(-5), 2-2]=[0,0]
$$

## Examples

## UNIVERSIDAD EAFIT

## Multiplicative Inverses - Example

## Multiplicative Inverses

$$
\begin{gathered}
X=[3,7] \\
\frac{1}{X}=\left[\frac{1}{7}, \frac{1}{3}\right] \\
S=\left\{(3)\left(\frac{1}{7}\right),(3)\left(\frac{1}{3}\right),(7)\left(\frac{1}{7}\right),(7)\left(\frac{1}{3}\right)\right\} \\
\frac{X}{X}=[\min S, \max S]=\left[\frac{3}{7}, \frac{7}{3}\right] \ni[1,1]
\end{gathered}
$$

